

**MINUTES**  
**MEETING OF THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS**  
**PLANNING & EXTERNAL RELATIONS COMMITTEE**  
**METROPOLITAN ATLANTA RAPID TRANSIT AUTHORITY**

**May 30, 2019**

The Board of Directors Planning & External Relations Committee met on May 30, 2019 at 9:35 a.m. in the Board Room on the 6<sup>th</sup> Floor of the MARTA Headquarters Building, 2424 Piedmont Road, Atlanta, Georgia.

**Board Members Present**

Robert L. Ashe, III, **Chair**  
Jim Durrett  
Roderick E. Edmond  
William 'Bill' Floyd  
Roderick A. Frierson  
Jerry Griffin  
Freda B. Hardage  
John 'Al' Pond  
Rita A. Scott  
W. Thomas Worthy

MARTA officials in attendance were: General Manager/ CEO Jeffrey A. Parker; C-Suite Team Members Chief Administrative Officer Luz Borrero, Chief of System Safety, Security & Emergency Management/Police Wanda Dunham, Chief Financial Officer Gordon L. Hutchinson, Chief Counsel Elizabeth O'Neill, Chief of Capital Programs, Expansion & Innovation Franklin Rucker and Chief of Rail Operations David Springstead; AGMs Heather Alhadeff, Marsha Anderson Bomar, LaShanda Dawkins, Virgil Fludd, James Sibert (Interim), Kirk Talbott, Emil Tzanov and Tom Young (Interim); Chief Information Security Officer Dean Mallis; Executive Director Paula Nash; Senior Directors Lyle Harris (Contractor), Jennifer Jinadu-Wright and George Wright; Directors Rhonda Allen, Jonathan Hunt, Jacqueline Holland (Acting), Douglas Miller, Pat Minnucci, Remy Saintil, William Taylor and Don Williams; Managers Jolando Crane, Stephany Fisher and Eric Leach; Sr. Executive Administrator Ashanti Boothe; Department Administrators Debra Oliver. Others in attendance Hunter Abel, Adrien Carter, Abebe Girmay, Cedric Griffin, Kerin Lester, Courtne Middlebrooks, Latoya O'Neal (Intern), LaTonya Pope and Ryan VanSickle.

Also in attendance Pam Alexander of LTK Engineering; Ehren Bingaman, Steve Brown, Catherine Owens, Carrie Rocha and Jim Schmidt of HNTB; Richard Campbell and Shelley Lamar of CERM; Steve Dickerson and Jennifer Laresa of the ATL; Scott Haggard and Scheree Rawles of the ATL/SRTA; Adam Halpin of Arcadis; Michael Hightower of the Collaborative Firm; Maggie Lee of Saporta Report; Helen McSwain of Rohadfox;

## **Planning & External Relations Committee**

**05/30/19**

**Page 2**

John Orr of ARC; Angela Schwrtz of Atkins; Kay Stephenson of Betline Rail Now; David Wickert of the AJC and Betty Willis of Emory.

### **Approval of the April 25, 2019 Planning & External Relations Committee Meeting Minutes**

On motion by Mr. Griffin seconded by Dr. Edmond, the minutes were unanimously approved by a vote of 8 to 0, with 8 members present.

### **Resolution Authorizing the Award of a Contract for the Procurement of Bus Stop Amenities, RFP P43079**

Mr. Williams presented a resolution authorizing the General Manager/CEO or his delegate to enter into a Contract with Autaco Development, LLC for the procurement of Bus Stop Amenities.

One of the major goals of the MARTA Board of Directors and Executive Management Team (EMT) is the installation of up to 1,000 bus shelters and benches over a five-year period. This procurement would be funded with 80% Federal Funds and 20% Locally Capital Funds from the approved Fiscal Year (FY) 2019 budget in the amount of \$15,639,200.

Mr. Pond thanked Mr. Williams for the presentation. He asked how was the price analysis for individual bus shelters selected.

Mr. Williams said the pricing for bus shelters and benches had different pricing components based on the terms of the program. The bus shelter analysis was selected from a previous quote of \$20K.

Mr. Pond asked was \$20K embedded in the bus shelter contract.

Mr. Williams said yes, \$20K is listed in the bus shelter contract.

Dr. Edmond said upon viewing the proposals provided there was a wide range of disparity between the highest and the lowest bid. He asked what evidence did Autaco provide to confirm that they would be able to execute the project for a low amount.

Mr. Williams said the Authority is currently working with Autaco in terms of installation of bus shelters and benches. When MARTA's staff viewed the overall pricing proposal, there were discrepancies regarding the increase of price. The difference in price was discussed and Autaco was able to provide their final offer at a lower price.

**Planning & External Relations Committee**

**05/30/19**

**Page 3**

Dr. Edmond said with Randolph & Company bidding \$35M and the Authority selected Autaco for \$16M, there is approximately a \$20M price difference between the highest and lowest proposals. He asked what questions was asked for Autaco to bid \$16M.

Mr. Williams said MARTA's staff looked at each cost item and noticed that the cost for specific items were higher than others. Randolph & Company listed different elements that could not be justified, which led the Authority to select Autaco as the final bidder.

Dr. Edmond asked was Randolph & Company seeking to receive a higher profit margin.

Mr. Williams said yes, Randolph & Company was seeking to receive a higher profit margin.

Mr. Floyd asked if the price within the contract is intended for labor only.

Mr. Williams said yes, this particular contract will be used for labor only.

Mr. Floyd asked would MARTA be responsible for ordering bus shelters for each installation.

Mr. Williams said MARTA would submit an order requesting the number of bus shelters and the contractor's manufacturer would be responsible for delivery and installation.

Mr. Floyd suggested MARTA host a celebratory event during some of the bus shelter installations.

Mr. Griffin said MARTA issued an advertising contract for the installation of benches in Clayton County. He asked if the Clayton County advertising contract related to the contract presented today.

Mr. Williams said no, the Clayton County Advertising Contract is separate from the contract presented today.

On motion by Mr. Griffin seconded by Mr. Floyd, the resolution was unanimously approved by a vote of 9 to 0, with 9 members present.

**Briefing – Update on Regional Transit Committee Planning Program**

Mr. Orr presented an update on the planning activities of the Regional Transit Committee (RTC) and the Atlanta Regional Commission (ARC).

## **Planning & External Relations Committee**

**05/30/19**

**Page 4**

### *ARC Transit Planning Process*

- Local/County Comprehensive Transportation Plans/Transit Operator Plan (CTP)
- Regional Transit Vision (Concept 3)
- Regional Transportation Plan (RTP)
- Transportation Improvement Program (TIP)

### *Core ARC Regional Transit Responsibilities*

- Federal and state required planning:
  - Recommendations for a financially unconstrained transit vision known as Concept 3
  - Identification of long-range RTP projects
  - Identification of short-range TIP projects
- Support for a Regional Transit Committee (RTC) and the Transit Operators Group
- ARC and the ATL Authority will coordinate in some areas moving forward, sharing some planning responsibilities with the goal to complement each organization's mission
  - ATL Authority's Regional Transit Plan
  - Special Studies

### *Recent Stages of Regional Transit Planning & Service Coordination*

- Regional Transit Institutional Analysis - 2004-2005
- Transit Planning Board (TPB) - 2006-2008
- Transit Implementation Board (TIP) - 2009
- Regional Transit Committee (RTC) – 2010 – present

### *RTC Organizational Next Steps*

- Continue to meet quarterly through 4<sup>th</sup> quarter 2019
  - Reassess the status of the Committee in the 4<sup>th</sup> quarter
  - Extend participation to all counties with existing or planned transit services
- Support both the ARC and the ATL Authority's Work Programs
  - Utilize RTC as transit discussion group to help inform regional planning in 2019
  - Emphasize discussions on the update of the Regional Transportation Plan in 2019

## **Planning & External Relations Committee**

**05/30/19**

**Page 5**

### *On-Going Planning Initiatives*

- Concept 3 Vision – identification of ARC's needs and specific projects that have been identified collectively moving into the future.

### *Plan Update Milestones*

- Regional Transportation Plan must be updated every four (4) years
- MARTA's current updates expire March 2020
- Updated approvals must be completed by February 2020, due to federal requirements

### *Current Regional Transit Expansion Projects*

- More MARTA Program adopted last October utilizing funding sources from recent referendum
- Rail up to Clifton Corridor
- Variety of projects on I-20 Corridor
- Projects on south side (Clayton County) Commuter Rail
- Variety of projects in Cobb & Fulton County

### *Fulton Transportation Plan*

- BRT on I-285
- BRT on GA-400
- Additional projects in South Fulton

### *Other Transit Planning Initiatives Underway (Examples)*

- Future Referendums Under Consideration
  - Gwinnett
  - DeKalb
  - Fulton
- Clayton County Transit Study
- Cobb County Transit Plan
- City of Smyrna Transit Study
- Forsyth County Transit Study
- Several Corridor Studies

- **Other Jurisdictions Considering Transit Next Steps**
  - Spalding
  - Newton
  - Coweta

Mr. Ashe asked if the Gwinnett County Expansion Plan would be incorporated in the Regional Transit Plan (RTC).

Mr. Orr said the ARC is currently working with staff in Gwinnett County to incorporate the RTC Plan.

Mr. Ashe asked what is the best way for individuals interested in following a particular project from start to end provide their input.

Mr. Orr said individuals may express their interest following projects by reaching out to the Manager of Transportation Access and Mobility Group, through ARC's Public Information Hotline or via email.

In closing Mr. Orr thanked MARTA's staff for an excellent partnership. It has been a pleasure working with Mr. Don Williams and other staff members within the Authority. I look forward to continuing a partnership between ARC and MARTA. We've been able to collectively do a lot of great things to help move the region forward.

### **Briefing – More MARTA Sequencing Update**

---

Mrs. Owens presented the current More MARTA Atlanta project sequencing plan followed by a brief history of activities from November 2016 to current.

#### ***Background***

In 2016, MARTA reached out to the City of Atlanta residents with a referendum of over seventy (70) projects. This referendum was seeking citizens to support financial funding extending transportation access throughout the City of Atlanta. A resounding yes was the response, so in 2016, a half-penny sales tax was passed to support expanding access to public transportation throughout the City of Atlanta focusing on accessibility, connectivity and mobility for the residents of the city. Once the project list passed, the City of Atlanta and MARTA came together and established an intergovernmental agreement as well as a nine (9) guiding principles to establish an accomplishable list of projects from the project list.

## **Planning & External Relations Committee**

**05/30/19**

**Page 7**

### *Guiding Principles*

- Multiple transportation modes
- Increase mobility
- Commute predictability
- Integrated transportation network
- Integrating into regional transit
- Safety and access
- Ease of use
- Last-mile connectivity
- Partner with neighboring jurisdictions to leverage transit projects

### *Based upon the guiding principles, MARTA established a two (2) step process*

- Step 1: Priority projects – requesting the Board approval October 2018 to narrow the list of projects from seventy-three (73) to seven-teen (17).
- Step 2: Implementation Plan – requesting the Board approval June 2019 to create a sequencing plan and financial strategy and refine cash flow model.

### **More MARTA Atlanta Plan (adopted Oct. 4, 2018)**

#### *Light Rail (LRT)*

- BeltLine NE
- BeltLine SE
- Campbellton Road
- Clifton Corridor
- Streetcar East Extension
- Streetcar West Extension
- BeltLine WE & SE

#### *Bus Rapid Transit (BRT)*

- Capitol Avenue
- North Avenue – Donald L. Hollowell Pkwy
- Northside Drive

#### *Arterial Rapid Transit (ART)*

- Peachtree Road
- Cleveland Avenue
- Metropolitan Parkway

## Planning & External Relations Committee

05/30/19

Page 8

### *City of Atlanta MARTA Station*

- Greenbriar Mill Transit Center
- Moores Mill Transit Center
- MARTA Stations

### More MARTA Cash Flow Model

#### *Integrated Cash Flow Analysis*

- Revenue forecast from GSU EFC
- Capital cost estimates (\$/mile or lump sum)
- O&M cost estimates (based on service)
- Sustaining capital cost estimates
- Inflation and capital cost escalation
- Federal grants and formula funds
- Bonds and debt service

#### Financial Assumptions

- Original high level revenue estimate  
Was just under \$3B, in current day
- More MARTA Atlanta sales tax revenue  
~\$5.9B (YOY)
- \$7M annual contributions to local bus
- Extend sales tax and bond repayment  
Beyond 40 years

#### Program Risks

- Project delivery approach
- Construction costs at project delivery
- Market conditions
- Federal grants availability and award
- Fare structure
- Sales tax renewal
- Sales tax renewal

#### *Considerations*

- Available cashflow
- Project readiness
- Geographic balance/equity
- Network connectivity
- More MARTA Atlanta committee input

#### *Based on the considerations, the team:*

- Developed 20+ scenarios and associated sequencing plans, and
- Achieved TAC and JPLG consensus on sequencing plan – April 25



**Planning & External Relations Committee**

**05/30/19**

**Page 9**

Dr. Edmond asked has data been reviewed to determine ridership for LRT, BRT and ART.

Mr. Rucker said there has been initial discussion regarding projected ridership for LRT, BRT and ART. Completion of the planning phase must be completed before finalization of data.

Mr. Ashe said upon going through the process of several projects, \$2.5B seems like a ton of money until a project demands utilization. If MARTA was able to get additional revenue streams, the Authority would be able to execute several projects.

Mr. Rucker said that is correct. Funding plays a big part in project completion.

Mr. Ashe said the region has spent a significant amount of time and energy discussing transit governance. However, there has not been a comparable amount of time and energy discussing new funding streams. One could expect that if new regional funding was to come on-line, MARTA would be positioned to complete projects and boost dollars as well.

Mrs. Owens said this is a starting point of the project and the project could possibly change as the process moves forward based upon other mechanisms.

Mr. Durrett asked what is the difference between station enhancements and station rehabilitation.

Mr. Parker said station enhancements is State of Good Repair bringing the condition of the stations lightning and flooring back to its original condition. Station rehabilitation is large enhancements such as station expansion.

Mr. Rucker said station rehabilitation will include upgrading MARTA's thirty-eight (38) stations. Station enhancements specifically deals with Five Points and Bankhead Stations.

## **Planning & External Relations Committee**

**05/30/19**

**Page 10**

### **Program Delivery Plan (2019-2025)**

- *In Service by 2025:*
  - Improved Local Bus Service
  - Capitol Avenue (Summerhill) BRT
  - Entire ART program (Metropolitan, Cleveland, Peachtree)
  - Campbellton AA
  - North Avenue BRT (Phase I)
- *Under Construction by 2025:*
  - Streetcar East Extension
  - Greenbriar Transit Center
  - Five Points Station
- *Continued Planning or Design by 2025*
  - Campbellton Road
  - Clifton Corridor
  - Southwest BeltLine
  - Northeast BeltLine

### ***Tier 2 Communications and Outreach Plan***

- Provide community and stakeholders with the project sequencing approved by MARTA Board of Directors
- Leverage various communications platforms and community-focused events to share updates on More MARTA Atlanta projects
- Shift community and stakeholder communications to project-centered engagement activities
- Update all existing collateral to reflect the sequencing of projects (i.e. More MARTA Atlanta microsite)

### **Resolution to Approve the Proposed More MARTA Atlanta Project Sequencing**

Mr. Rucker presented a resolution authorizing the General Manager/CEO or his delegate to approve the recommended More MARTA Atlanta sequencing plan for project implementation.

On motion by Dr. Edmond seconded by Mr. Durrett, the resolution was unanimously approved by a vote of 9 to 0, with 9 members present.

**Planning & External Relations Committee**

**05/30/19**

**Page 11**

\* \* \*

**Adjournment**

---

The meeting of the Planning & External Relations Committee adjourned at 10:40 a.m.